CODE
connecteddevelopment.org

Tracking UBE Spending in Kaduna State

[Annual Report, Year 1]

NGN 569,579,737.83 (USD 1.5 million) tracked

Across 23 School Projects in 20 Communities!
1.4 million Media Reach

With Support from
MacArthur Foundation

www.ifollowthemoney.org

Founded in 2012, Connected Development [CODE] is a non-governmental organization [NGO] whose mission is to empower marginalized communities in Africa. We strengthen local communities by creating platforms for dialogue, enabling informed debate, and building capacities of citizens on how to hold their government accountable through Follow The Money. CODE provides marginalized and vulnerable communities with resources to amplify their voices with independence and integrity while providing the communities with information that ushers social and economic progress. To enhance effective democratic governance and accountability, CODE creates platforms [mobile and web technologies] that close the feedback loop between citizens and the government. With global expertise and reach, we focus on community outreach, influencing policies, practices, and knowledge mobilization.

CODE's commitment to participatory capacity & community building and monitoring and evaluation creates effective and sustainable programs even within the most challenging environments.

Project management and text: Chambers Umezulike, Kingsley Agu, Zaliha Lawal
Reviewers: Ojonwa Miachi, Hamzat Lawal
Design: Wilson S.U. Atumeyi
Photo: KC Nwakalor, Etinosa Yvonne

List of Abbreviations

CODE - Connected Development
SUBEB - State Universal Basic Education Board
Kad-SUBEB – Kaduna State Universal Basic Education Board
UBEC - Universal Basic Education Commission
ES - Educational Secretary
TO - Technical Officer
SBMC - School Based Management Committee
SMT - School Monitoring Team
NUT - National Union of Teachers
PTA - Parents Teachers Association
BOQ - Bills of Quantity
ECCDE - Early Childhood Care, Development and Education
LGA - Local Government Area
LGEA - Local Government Education Authority
GDP- Gross Domestic Product
CBA - Community Based Association
CBO - Community Based Organization
CATI - Community Accountability & Transparency Initiative
FTM - Follow The Money
PPM - Physical Project Monitoring
SM - Social Mobilization

Table of Contents

Photo: CODE/Nwakalor, 2017

Executive Summary

Within the past 5 years, Connected Development [CODE] through its Follow The Money Initiative has tracked and monitored public spending in rural communities across Nigeria, impacting an estimate of 600,000 lives covering 50 communities, in over 20 states. Through following the money, the organization has promoted and ensured open government, improved service delivery in the execution of community projects by government, exposed and mitigated corruption, as well as fought extreme poverty in rural communities.

In July 2017, the organization finalized processes involved in securing a grant from The MacArthur Foundation, for the project, Tracking UBE Spending in Kaduna State. The 3-year project involves strengthening the capacity of School Monitoring Teams (SMTs) which consists of Community Based Associations/Organizations (CBA/Os), School Based Monitoring Committees (SBMCs), Parents Teachers Association (PTA) etc. to conduct high quality tracking of Universal Basic Education (UBE) spending in 70 schools in the state. The project's first year focused on 23 primary schools across Jema'a, Kudan, Kajuru and Zango Kataf Local Government Areas (LGA). 16 projects were tracked from the state's 2014 UBE Action Plan and 7 projects were tracked from the 2015's Action Plan.

In the first year of the project, we strengthened the capacity of these aforementioned monitoring agents; jointly monitored project implementation across 23 schools; channeled project implementation findings (three reports) to Kaduna SUBEB (Kad-SUBEB) for redressal; as well as enhanced citizens' engagement in basic education spending in the state through Follow The Money Radio Kaduna and town hall meetings. Project implementation has been completed in 14 of the schools, and ongoing in the remaining 9 (see table 1).

Beneficiaries in the course of project implementation include over 80 of the SMTs and SUBEB/LGEA officials who were directly trained; as well as over 200 community stakeholders who were indirectly trained through step-down trainings by the SMTs and provided with access to relevant project monitoring data. Ultimately, the beneficiaries include pupils and teachers from the selected schools as our activities led to service delivery across 70% of the projects through enhanced public oversight

Findings from the first year of the project encompass:
- Through feedback from the SMTs, a number of projects implemented across board by contractors were poor of quality. .

- Kad-SUBEB does not allow the SBMCs to act in a sufficiently autonomous manner in project monitoring. Feedback accessed from the SBMCs during a session with the SMTs suggests that SBMCs are not carried along on needs assessment across community schools to feed the UBE action plan of the state that is sent to UBEC annually for intervention access. In addition, the SBMCs have not been effective in project monitoring across schools because they lack necessary project and financial data. The SBMCs had no prior knowledge of the school projects until we engaged. This was due to the lack of a proper framework from Kad-SUBEB to empower them with key data to ensure effective public oversight on the projects.

- Despite the information sharing collaboration with Kad-SUBEB, the board has not been able to address some of the project implementation challenges pointed out during the town hall meetings and through the routine project monitoring reports sent to KAD-SUBEB periodically.

- Another feedback from the tracking exercise is that project contractors did not cooperate with SMTs because Kad-SUBEB did not create that formal link.

As such, its important Kad-SUBEB works on a framework through which the SBMCs can inform Kad-SUBEB's annual action plans to UBEC. Kad-SUBEB also has to work on a framework through which SBMCs can always access list of school projects currently being implemented and be provided with project implementation data. In furtherance, Kad-SUBEB has to mandate project contractors to always pay courtesy calls on community leaders at the commencement of projects or have communities in participation when the handing over of project sites to contractors is being carried out. Lastly, Kad-SUBEB should revamp its project monitoring strategy to make it more effective, swiftly address issues raised by the SMTs/SBMCs, and ensure contractors strictly implement the bills of quantities before being paid off.

Thanks to The MacArthur Foundation for making this experience possible.

We also appreciate our officers in Kaduna State, Kingsley Agu and Zaliha Lawal who were our legs in the state and made sure the first year of the project was implemented clinically.

And to you reading this, thanks for all your support.

Best Regards!

Hamzat B. Lawal
Chief Executive

Table 1 (Projects Matrix:)

No	LGA	Description of Project	School/ Location	Community Population	Contractors	Project Status Before campaign started	Current Project Status as at May 2018
1	Zango Kataf	Construction of Block of 2 Classrooms (ECCDE)	Zama P.S	N/A	Larai International Resources Nig. Ltd	Not started	Completed
2		Construction/Rehabilitation of Existing Facilities	Fadan Kamantan P.S	38,000	Hilal Project Nigeria Ltd.	Not started	Completed
3		Construction of a Block of Laboratory	GJSS Gan Gora	N/A	Belmont Nigeria Ltd.	Not started	Completed
4		Construction of a Block of 4 Classrooms	GJSS Ashafa Gida	N/A	HSB Nigeria Ltd.	On-going (Foundation level)	Completed but inbuilt cupboard not in accordance with BoQ; windows finishing not smooth; blackboard rough; padlocks not the prescribed types (Crittal Hope Standards)
5		Construction of a Block of 4 Classrooms	GJSS Afana	N/A	Geiburo Investment Limited	Abandoned (foundation level)	On-going (roofing level)
6	Jema'a	Construction/Rehabilitation of Existing Facilities	Nisama P.S	6,000	Mantankadi Global Ventures Limited	Not started	Completed (The external vent for the toilet not tightly fixed to the wall and could be blown off)
7		Construction of a Block of Laboratory	GJSS Bankin Kogi Kaninkon	N/A	Our Fathers Business Ventures.	Not started	Completed according to the BOQs
8		Construction of a Block of	GJSS Kwagiri	N/A	Kolbe Gurasa	On-going (foundation)	Completed

Table 1 (Projects Matrix:)

No	LGA	Description of Project	School/ Location	Community Population	Contractors	Project Status Before campaign started	Current Project Status as at May 2018
9	Jema'a	Construction of a Block of 24 Classrooms, office and toilets	Waziri Aliyu Model	79,000	Tsangaya International Ventures Ltd	Not started	Ongoing
10		Construction of a Block of 4 Classrooms	GJSS Kafanchan	79,000	Havage Engineering Services Ltd	Not started	Ongoing
11	Kajuru	Construction/Rehabilitation of Existing Facilities	Kufana P.S	4,000	Linket Nigeria Limited.	Work not commenced	On-going (60% completed)
12		Construction of a Block of Laboratory	GJSS Maro	N/A	Nagoma+ Associates Nig. Ltd	On-going (Foundation level)	Completed in accordance with the BoQ
13		Construction of a Block of 4 Classrooms	GJSS Tudun	N/A	Sardaunan Tudun Wada	Not Started	Completed
14		Construction of a Block of 4 Classrooms	GJSS Gujeni	N/A	Hafsco Global Ventures	On-going (At the foundation stage)	Completed
15		Construction of a Block of 2 Classrooms with Children Restroom and toilet	UBE Aku	N/A	Ammah Contractors Limited	Abandoned (At foundation level for the toilet)	On-going
16		Construction of a Block of 12 Classrooms	Kajuru I	N/A	Oases Habitat Building Ltd	Not started (The project was diverted to another school with the claim the they do not have sufficient land for block of 12 classrooms to be constructed)	On-going

Table 1 (Projects Matrix:)

No	LGA	Description of Project	School/ Location	Community Population	Contractors	Project Status Before campaign started	Current Project Status as at May 2018
17		Construction of a Block of 4 Classrooms	Ung. Kero	N/A	De-Raheem Concept Ltd	Abandoned (At foundation level)	
18	Kudan	Construction/Rehabilitation of Existing Facilities	Likoro P.S	N/A	Chanji Global Resources	On-going	Completed (contractor reported to the EFCC by community members because of the 2,211,610 Naira earmarked for fence construction that is yet to be accounted for)
19		Construction/Rehabilitation of Existing Facilities	Taban Sani P.S	16,000	Sapbi Nigeria Limited	NotStarted	Completed (Storage in the newly constructed block is falling off)
20		Construction of a Block of Laboratory	GJSS Hunkuyi	N/A	Alhaji Sarki Mailemu Global Links Limited	Not Started	Completed in line with BoQ
21		Construction of a Block of 4 Classrooms	GJSS Likoro	N/A	Dankeke Nigeria Limited	Not Started	Completed in line with BoQ
22		Construction of a Block of Laboratory	GJSS Kauran Wali	N/A	General Renewable Ltd	Not Started	On-going
23		Construction of a Block of 4 Classrooms	GJSS Kauran Wali	N/A	Sapbi Nigeria Ltd	Not Started	On-going

Section One [Introduction]

In 2004, the Federal Government of Nigeria passed the Universal Basic Education Act which authorizes the Universal Basic Education Commission to improve the enrolment of primary school children, reduce the current dropout rates, and enhance the quality of basic education. Since then, the commission provides basic education funding to State Universal Basic Education Boards and the Local Government Education Authorities (LGEA) to implement projects and activities that can lead to the achievement of the aforementioned objectives. Despite this, Nigeria did not achieve the 2015 Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) for education, which was expected, given that in 2013, the primary school completion rate and gender parity index stood only at 74 and 90 percentages, respectively. In addition, access to education still remains a challenge: the gross enrolment ratio (GER) stood at 84 percent at the primary level, 75 percent in lower secondary, and 64 percent in upper secondary in the 2013 Demographic and Health Survey. As such, the country currently hosts the largest number of out-of-school primary school children.

Part of the problem encompasses limited access to quality basic education infrastructure, which is substantiated with the fact that 28 percent of teachers have expressed that there is an inadequate amount of appropriate textbooks or other instructional materials available in public schools according to the Universal Basic Education Commission [UBEC] 2013 survey. Girls' participation in education remains below that of boys across all levels of education, and the gender gap is significantly more pronounced at the upper secondary level. The difference between areas of residence is even starker with a GER of 100 percent in urban areas compared with 74 percent in rural areas at the primary level.

One of the key factors responsible for this desolate state of basic education in the country has been poor governance, which manifests mainly through lack of transparency and accountability in government spending; corruption; poor service delivery etc. Corruption has affected service delivery across board, including diversion of government revenues through tax evasion, as well as leakages on current and capital expenditures. Petty corruption directly impedes access to education for the poor. According to a recent survey by ActionAid, nearly half of the respondents claim that they have to pay a bribe to secure admission to school for their children. In addition, patronage, mismanagement, poor costing and procurement inefficiencies, have often affected the implementation of capital projects in schools.

As such, according to the 2015 World Bank Governance and Finance Analysis of the Basic Education Sector in Nigeria, transparency and accountability in school management needs to be strengthened to provide an enabling climate for learning, increase enrollment rate and achieve better learning outcomes. The report recommended strengthening SBMCs and other types of community-level grassroots mobilization networks to generate awareness for education, including developing sensitization campaigns for communities to engage in service delivery around education. Highlights emanating from the report proposes that one of the key contributing factors to the limited enforcement capabilities on school accountability and transparency is the weak data collection tool, as well as the inconsistent and unreliable M&E generated by UBEC. For example, UBE law mandates UBEC to carry out M&E for grades 1-9 but UBEC tends to rely on states to carry out

Cont..Section One [Introduction]

M&E for grades 1-9 but UBEC tends to rely on states to carry out data collection on their behalf, which often use weak data collection tools which produce inconsistent and unreliable data.

In addition and ironically, community groups and established monitoring agents such as the School Based Management Committees, and community development associations, do not have the necessary incentives to express their feedback on government spending performance in education due to lack of reliable information and distrust in the government, and at same time, governments need incentives to respond to citizen inputs whenever possible and to leverage citizen participation.

Its against this background that CODE secured a grant from The MacArthur Foundation, for the project, ***Tracking UBE Spending in Kaduna State.*** The 3-year project aims to:

- Enhance citizens' participation in UBE spending in the state by establishing School Monitoring Teams responsible for ensuring effective service delivery to increase demands while setting citizen's monitoring framework using data from the ground.

- Strengthen the capacity of existing monitoring agents and stakeholders such as community based organizations and associations to be directly linked to reports on State Universal Basic Education Board spending on basic education.

- Strengthening project Linkages between the government, citizens and investigative reports from media organizations (The Cable, Sahara Reporters, Premium Times), civic tech organizations like BudgIT, and Procurement Monitor.

Section Two [Activities Narrative]
2.1 Courtesy call on Kad-SUBEB Executive Chairman

Group Photo with the Executive chairman and Permanent Secretary of Kad-SUBEB after the meeting

Photo: Ibrahim Aminu, 2017

On 25 August 2017, the CODE delegation paid a courtesy visit on the Executive Chairman of Kad-SUBEB, in the person of Nasir Umar in his office in Kaduna to get the buy-in and support of the Board in the project. In attendance were the Permanent Secretary of Kad-SUBEB, Mrs Nana Kande Bage; the Director of Social Mobilization (SM), Mallam Ibrahim Aminu; and the CODE delegation. The key highlight of the meeting was that the Executive Chairman gave his full support to the project and directed that all the Directors should render whatever assistance CODE will need especially as regards access to information.

The engagement with the various departments commenced immediately as we visited the Physical Project Monitoring (PPM) Director in his office to confirm a tender advertisement for bids' submission on projects from the state's 2014 UBE Action Plan, which CODE obtained online. We subsequently demanded for the post bids' evaluation data for the projects in Kudan, Kajuru, Jemaa and Zango Kataf LGA, which were immediately made available. The bills of quantities for the projects were provided later. We ended the visit with a meeting with the SM Director where we discussed the proposed stakeholders meeting.

2.2 Project Launch Stakeholders Meeting

Group photo of participants
Photo: Etinosa Yvonne / CODE, 2017

On 14 September 2017, CODE organized a stakeholders meeting at the NUT Endwell Conference Hotel, Kaduna to launch the Tracking UBE Spending Project, as well as garner the support of these key stakeholders in project implementation. In the meeting were over 80 participants which included the representative of the Honourable Commissioner of Education, Science and Technology; Representative of Kad-SUBEB Chairman; Permanent Secretary Kad-SUBEB; several directors at Kad-SUBEB, NUT Chairmen and Secretaries, Education Secretaries of LGAs, SBMCs' Chairmen and Secretaries from all the 23 Local Governments of Kaduna State, Pupils from the four focal local governments (Kudan, Kajuru, Jema'a and Zangon Kataf), Community Based Organizations (CBOs) and the Press.

Key highlights of the meeting were opening remarks by the Chief Executive of CODE, Hamzat Lawal; representatives of the executive Chairman of Kad-SUBEB and the Honourable Commissioner of Education, Science and Technology. This was followed by a presentation by CODE Senior Programmes Manager, who took the participants through the Tracking UBE Spending Project. In his presentation, he started with taking the participants through what Follow The Money is all about; the goals of the project, duration, the focal LGAs; and went further to explain the activities, outputs, outcomes etc. of the project. This was followed by questions from participants as concerns the project which were all addressed. The stakeholders meeting ended with a unanimous support for the project and the Permanent Secretary Kad-SUBEB, Mrs Nana Kande Bage gave the vote of thanks.

2.3 Dual training for SMTs and Kad-SUBEB personnel

Group photo of participants
Photo: CODE/Nwakalor, 2017

CODE carried out dual trainings for School Monitoring Teams (SMTs), as well as Kad-SUBEB staff and LGEA staff. The first round of trainings took place at NUT Endwell Conference Hotel LTD, Kaduna from the 3rd to 5th of October, 2017 while the second round of trainings took place at Zecool Hotels LTD, Kaduna from the 14th to 15th of May, 2018. Both round of trainings had in attendance Educational Secretaries from Kajuru, Kudan, Jema'a and Zangon Kataf LGAs, Staff of Kad-SUBEB, Members of SMTs from LGAs, Amina Salihu (Senior Program Officer of The MacArthur Foundation) and other members of The MacArthur Foundation Education Cohort in Kaduna State. The Kad-SUBEB staff and LGEA staff participants were trained on data process management, routine monitoring data, data value chain, data coding/analysis and fundamentals of M&E. They were also carried through a tour of Africa's Social Accountability Initiatives and Anti-Graft Sites.

During the first round of trainings for SMTs, they were trained on how to effectively track UBE spending across schools in the state. In unpacking this, we took them through the Follow the Money work process, covering issues of citizen engagement, active citizenry, budget tracking etc. We introduced them to the Tracking UBE Spending project, the scope, the window of implementation, goals, activities and most importantly, their roles. We also took them through the 2014 UBE action plan of the state, and provided them with the list of successful bidders for the projects, bills of quantities, and reporting templates for field visits.

The training also featured a session on the roles and challenges of SBMCs in basic education capital projects implementation in the state. The discussion was on their experience in monitoring the implementation of contracts, flagging underutilisation, receipt of funding from SUBEB/LGEA, information flow etc. The second round of trainings featured a recap of the year of the project and key outputs. After this session was an experience sharing with the SMTs on tracking the school projects, challenges, feedback, lessons

Cont..Dual training for SMTs and Kad-SUBEB personnel

implementation, red flags etc. In conclusion, there was elaborate discussion on the sustainability of the partnership after CODE phases out of the LGAs, perhaps in the second year of the project. As a result, we discussed the way forward, tools for continuous engagements (FTM Radio in Kaduna, phone-lines, Whatsapp, SM etc.), how Kad-SUBEB can be reached with infrastructural priorities across their schools, as well as how UBE action plans, tender advertisements, list of successful bidders documents, and bills of quantities can be accessed and assessed independently. To further ensure sustainability, shared were the 2016 UBE projects with the SMTs to foster independent tracking of the projects as the implementation of these projects is about starting in the state. A bi-annual report template was also shared with the teams as CODE plans to provide technical support for another year.

2.4 Community Outreach (on site visits) to Project Sites

Group photo of participants during Nisama Community Outreach
Photo: Etinosa Yvonne / CODE, 2017

Follow The Money team organized several community outreaches in the four focal LGA (Kudan, Kajuru, Jemaa and Zango Kataf) where we met with staff of schools where project is being carried out, SMTs, village heads and community members to educate them on the project details, provide BOQs for the projects and train them on the need to track/monitor the UBEC/Kad-SUBEB and other government projects in their communities. It was also an opportunity to carry out on the spot assessment of the on-going UBEC/Kad-SUBEB projects in their communities to ascertain if work is being done according to the specification in the BOQs and raise red flags on areas where the project implementation is not going on as planned. The community outreaches were specifically at Taban Sani, Kufana, Nisama and Fadan Kamatan communities from Kudan, Kajuru, Jemaa and Zango Kataf LGAs, respectively. These locations were used as a focal point for other 2014 UBEC/Kad-SUBEB projects within their respective LGAs. The SMTs in each LGA also carried out community outreaches in the other locations within their respective LGAs where other projects were being implemented.

2.5 Town hall meetings in four LGAs for 23 schools.

Picture of participant seated during the town Hall meeting at Taban Sani
Photo: Zaliha Lawal/CODE, 2017

The FTM team organized town hall meetings in Taban Sani Primary School on the 14th of November for Kudan LGA; Nisama Model Primary School on the 15th of November 2017 for Jemaa LGA; Government Secondary School, Fadan Kamatan on the 16th of November 2017 for Zango Kataf LGA; and Kufana 1 Primary School on the 17th of November 2017 for Kajuru LGA. Each of these town hall meetings had an average of over 50 people in attendance from a cross section of Kad-SUBEB representatives, educational secretaries, technical officers of SUBEB, headteachers of concerned schools, principals of concerned schools, NUT members, SBMC members, PTA members, district and village heads, women leaders, youth leaders, contractors, media and members of the community.

The essence of the town hall meeting was to bring together the project implementing agency (Kad-SUBEB), contractors, staff of beneficiary schools and community members to discuss project implementation status and address issues with the projects. During the meeting, the Kad-SUBEB representatives pledged to take up issues raised and have them addressed as soon as possible. Notable among these issues were:

- The fence in Likoro Primary School that was included in the project when the school already had a fence.
- The contractor that handled the project at Zama Primary School who complained of the very large variation of ₦429,426 in the amount quoted for roofing sheet in the BOQ and the actual amount in the market. Contractors that were slow in implementing their respective projects and those that abandoned their respective projects were urged to speed up work and return back to site respectively by Kad-SUBEB representatives.

2.6 Data Access from Kaduna SUBEB

Through the call on Kad-SUBEB Executive Chairman for an information sharing partnership, all the required project implementation data down to the BOQs were provided as requested. In addition, the board participated in the town hall meetings we organized at the local government level, where project implementation challenges were discussed and relevant stakeholders made commitments to address them. They were also at the trainings for SMTs, and actively participated in theirs.

2.7 Follow The Money Radio

We commissioned Follow The Money Radio Kaduna on Liberty FM 91.7. It started in November 2017, and runs bi-weekly on Tuesdays from 10:00 - 10:45. The radio programme reaches an audience of 1.3 million thereby enhancing greater citizen participation in the implementation of basic education spending in the state. Through the programme, we were able to share the project's progress across concerned communities, and stimulated citizens' interest and participation in providing public oversight (social accountability) on projects under consideration. Through this, we have successfully recruited volunteers which include engineers, who participated in the radio programme's episodes via calls.

Photo: CODE/Nwakalor, 2017

Section Three [Activities, Goals and Outputs Matrix] .

Goals	Activities	Ouputs
Enhancing citizens' participation by establishing a School Monitoring Team responsible for ensuring effective service delivery to increase demands while setting citizen's monitoring framework using data from the ground.	Organized a project launch stakeholder meeting	1 stakeholder meeting with 80 participants in attendance
	Establishment of School Monitoring teams from the 4 focal Local Government Areas in Kaduna State.	4 SMTs were established
	Town hall meetings across the 4 LGAs	4 town hall meetings
	Commissioning of Follow The Money Radio	Bi-monthly radio programme on UBEC/SUBEB tracking on Liberty FM
Strengthening of existing monitoring agents and stakeholders such as community based organizations and associations to be directly linked to reports on State Universal Basic Education spending on basic education	Trainings for KADSUBEB officials and SMTs	Dual trainings for each of them with an estimate of 30 participants in attendance. Liberty FM
Strengthening project Linkages between the government, citizens and investigative reports from media organizations (The Cable, Sahara Reporters, Premium Times), civic tech organizations like BudgIT, and Procurement Monitor.	Project linkages were strengthened between Kad-SUBEB, the SMTs and Kaduna Citizens and media organizations such as News Agency of Nigeria and Liberty FM, as well as civic tech organizations.	------

Section Four: 4.1 Enabling Factors
Kad-SUBEB Responsiveness and Support

One of the key enabling factors to the project's success was Kad-SUBEB's receptive nature and support throughout the course of the project implementation especially in the area of data provision. The board availed CODE all requested data till date on the school projects implemented, cutting across the list of successful bidders' document, project amounts, bills of quantities etc. Also, the Board assisted CODE in getting across to basic education governmental and non-governmental stakeholders at the LGA level, who later became part of the SMTs. In addition, the board participated in the town hall meetings and other key activities including being a guest on Follow The Money Radio Kaduna.

4.2 Challenges
Challenges encountered in the first year of project implementation include:

Cost-Incurring Monitoring Activities versus Project Sustainability
The SMTs complained about financial challenges in the course of monitoring projects routinely and channeling feedback to us. This was addressed by providing them with transportation costs for routine monitoring visits to project sites even though it was not captured in the budget submitted to The Foundation. As further payments beyond the transportation stipends will impede on the project's sustainability, further requests for financial incentives by selected members of the SMTs was discouraged by the project implementation team. Instead, the selected members of SMTs who requested for additional financial incentives were encouraged by their peers to engage in project monitoring as volunteers.

Limited Data and Autonomy provided by Kad-SUBEB to SMTs to Monitor Projects
Feedback from SBMCs suggests that Kad-SUBEB does not allow SBMCs to act in a sufficiently autonomous manner in project monitoring. CODE liaised with the Board to bridge this gap during the trainings organized for the SMTs, where Kad-SUBEB committed to making sure the SBMCs access project implementation documents whenever requested. A meeting has further been scheduled with Kad-SUBEB Executive Chairman to also get a high profile commitment on this, and have the Physical Project Monitoring department mainstream the SMBCs in their project implementation exercise. Through the second round of trainings for SMTs, direct links through which SMTs can ascertain the projects Kad-SUBEB is currently implementing and the procession for accessing project implementation data have been created with the Board.

Insecurity
For security prone areas such as in Kajuru, Jema'a and Zango Kataf LGAs, CODE always consults with the SMTs who have immense local knowledge of conflict-affected communities prior to scheduled outreaches. As such, no precarious challenges have been experienced by the implementation team.

Pending Commitments from Kad-SUBEB

Despite the information sharing collaboration with Kad-SUBEB, pending commitments such as the replacement of the Likoro primary school fence made during town hall meetings and feedback sessions from routine project monitoring reports are yet to be addressed by the board. CODE is following up with the Board to address these challenges using a number of avenues, including Follow The Money Radio in the state to drive this.

4.3 Lessons Learnt

1. Building partnerships with state agents like the Kad-SUBEB gave us easy entry.

CODE believes that learning is both a social and active process.The first activity implemented in the course of the project's first year was a courtesy call on the Kad-SUBEB Executive Chairman, for an information sharing partnership. This was an outstanding step as identifying with CODE's mission in the state, the board availed CODE all project implementation documentations we requested till date, through Freedom of Information requests. This was a better approach to secure their buy-in and commitment, at project commencement.

2. Kaduna State Open Government Partnership Membership helped in providing data Seamlessly.

CODE has also empirically observed the open government perception variance amongst government officials at sub-national level in the country. While a number of government bodies/agencies such as Kaduna State share government data, some other states are repressive and suppressive to calls for open government or transparency. For instance, The Kaduna experience occasioned the participation of local non-governmental stakeholders in projects implementation, ensuring public oversight and community ownership of the projects, while in Ondo State, CODE had an experience whereby the state's Conditional Grant Scheme Committee (CGSC) did not provide project specifics on the construction and rehabilitation works at Ayorinde Baptist Primary School at Iyere where we had a campaign. The CGSC also indicated that they would not be attending the town hall meeting that was subsequently organized and kept to their word. Another instance is that while the Delta State government informed CODE of FOI non-domestication in the state, Kaduna State became the first state in the country to sign onto the open government partnership.

3. Having already organized community groups lead conversations, improved the effectiveness of our T&A work.

In the course of our activities, we have been able to rejig or adjust our work processes according to prevailing local peculiarities. For instance, more than ever, CODE appreciates the need for indigenes or residents of host communities in our team. This helps us in managing social (group) dynamics without meddling with local political structures. The essence of this is to avoid political colouration or interpretation to our activities especially from political oppositions. Again, having community members (community reporters) in our team helps us manage the security and safety of our team during reconnainse visits, community outreaches and town hall meetings. We have such volunteers in Kaduna State who were instrumental to the project's first year. Ensuring the security and safety of our team is critical to our success even as Nigeria is contending with rural banditry and terrorism.

We also learnt that the SBMCs roles in Kaduna State were extremely superficial. For our focal LGAs, we have successfully mainstreamed them into monitoring projects from the 2014, 2015 and 2016 action plans of the Kad-SUBEB - While creating frameworks for sustainability so that they can inform the selection of the annual school projects and be actively engaged in project monitoring.

4.4 Policy Recommendations

First, Kad-SUBEB has to work on a framework through which the SBMCs can inform Kad-SUBEB's annual action plans to UBEC. It was great to see that the SBMCs were constituted and active across LGAs in Kaduna State, unlike in other parts of the country where they are non-existent or at best, only on paper. Kad-SUBEB has also provided trainings to the SBMCs and has often leveraged on various forums to remind them of their roles and responsibilities. SBMCs exist at the school and LGA levels. For the latter, they were in touch with the educational secretaries. However, there are major gaps in the operations of the SBMCs. Feedback accessed from the SBMCs during a discussion session suggests that they are not carried along on needs assessment across community schools to feed the UBE action plan of the state that is sent to UBEC annually, for intervention access. This is actually one of their primary responsibilities as a committee - being able to to aggregate critical learning priorities in schools across their communities and transmitting to Kad-SUBEB through an effective framework. Hence, the need for such a framework or information channel.

Kad-SUBEB also has to work on a framework through which SBMCs can always access list of school projects currently being implemented and be provided with project implementation data. This was because, the SBMCs have not been effective in project monitoring across schools because they lack necessary project and financial data. The SBMCs had no prior knowledge of the school projects until we engaged with them. This was due to the lack of a proper framework from Kad-SUBEB to empower them with key data to ensure effective public oversight on the projects. The existence of SBMCs will be futile if the committees are unable to effectively influence project planning and implementation.

Secondly, Kad-SUBEB should mandate project contractors to always pay courtesy calls on community leaders at the commencement of projects or have communities in participation when the handing over of project sites to contractors is being carried out. This would ensure that communities are introduced to contractors formally for effective engagement between both parties and smooth monitoring by SBMCs This recommendation is paramount because feedback from the SBMCs suggest that project contractors do not cooperate with the committee because Kad-SUBEB did not create that formal link.

Thirdly, Kad-SUBEB should revamp its project monitoring strategy to make it more effective, swiftly address issues raised by the SMTs/SBMCs, and ensure contractors strictly implement the bills of quantities before being paid off. As part of the feedback from the SMTs, poor quality of completed projects were reported. For instance, the newly constructed school fence at Fadan Kamatan PS in Zango Kataf LGA has been blown off by a storm.

4.5 Next Steps and Conclusion

Next step is to track projects under the 2015/2016 UBE Action Plan of the State, while we kick-start the second year of the project. In conclusion, it is believed that upon the completion of the 3-year project, the SMTs will get a firmer grip on understanding the processes of engaging government on UBE spending which will yield better service delivery especially in basic education in Kaduna State.

Photo: CODE/Nwakalor, 2017

Appendix

List of Schools Tracked in Kaduna (I)
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1nXeyIOd_fKafGujuyJPaTg0YvPO5SXAyu0zBTcN9xlA/edit?usp=sharing

List of Schools Tracked in Kaduna (II)
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1iuNN_eo1q9NNK0-WLKm5T1-QObwbKkE7Z5d4GI43TAY/edit?usp=sharing

Report on the Stakeholders Meeting
https://docs.google.com/document/d/15i01qfGLLjcTqbexXYCpHpT1m-0uuvze-kHd4tCpX50/edit?usp=sharing

Report on the SBMCs etc and SUBEB trainings
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1cLgulHCsH1LEmun7zYVJGcZJ9k_APeEh-ksuB162yAo/edit?usp=sharing

Town Hall Meetings Reports
Kudan: https://ifollowthemoney.mn.co/posts/1361924
Kajuru: https://ifollowthemoney.mn.co/posts/1366291
Zango Kataf: https://ifollowthemoney.mn.co/posts/1365445
Jema'a: https://ifollowthemoney.mn.co/posts/1365484

Second Community Outreach - Project Tracking Reports
Kudan:
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1i-5HrE8lD872WnxG7qiU2vqHyPce4nOOHwuR95m2Nro/edit?usp=sharing

Kajuru:https://docs.google.com/document/d/1CYN6sdtzNON7HQMWUYcBy8jxNKhbSfl9gWi-90mdlyc/edit?usp=sharing
Jema'a:https://docs.google.com/document/d/1Nj9Amalwzhyf8K7Nx48FUs9g5gUJDn8cTH6rBb75Tc4/edit?usp=sharing
Zango Kataf:
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1Nj9Amalwzhyf8K7Nx48FUs9g5gUJDn8cTH6rBb75Tc4/edit?usp=sharing

cont..Appendix

Outreach on Last 7 Projects

Jema'a -
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1UuSWGIFMT9LiD_298iwufDq7_Ygah-1j6QafSqq7k1o/edit?usp=sharing

Kajuru -
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1DYBw2DpHmQGfCFhQTtAwALMDVsfEO2uMSraW3sjI5uE/edit?usp=sharing

Kudan -
https://docs.google.com/document/d/1Qw07F7w2bwzkPg0omETuoM2s6RoNEg5SDltszJPnRUg/edit?usp=sharing

Report to Kad-SUBEB after second monitoring exercise

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1Qw07F7w2bwzkPg0omETuoM2s6RoNEg5SDltszJPnRUg/edit?usp=sharing

Report to Kad-SUBEB on projects implementation findings from feedback from SMTs in May

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1bICWtrARUVIO7CJMT21Ts-UsZ7f72anU--lo7gE0S4A/edit?usp=sharing

Projects Monitoring Summary and Issues Identified as at May 2018

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1KlzyFI5vTucjKcBXlxOPUASb8LFcz-Ygk6OpW8v57zE/edit?usp=sharing

Connected Development [CODE]
www.connecteddevelopment.org
Bassan Plaza, 10th Street, 3rd Floor, D Wing
Behind Total House, Central Business District,
FCT, Abuja, Nigeria.
(+234) 09-2917545

www.ifollowthemoney.org