ADVANCING ECONOMIC GOVERNANCE AND PROMOTING ACCOUNTABILITY IN NORTHERN NIGERIA

PROJECT IMPACT REPORT 2017-2019

Tracked NGN 523,743,810 (USD 1,454,843.92)
Reached 6 STATES | 84 COMMUNITIES | 1,276,780 Rural Lives

www.ifollowthemoney.org

WITH SUPPORT FROM

OSIWA
Founded in 2012, Connected Development [CODE] is a non-governmental organization [NGO] whose mission is to empower marginalized communities in Africa. We strengthen local communities by creating platforms for dialogue, enabling informed debate, and building capacities of citizens on how to hold their government accountable through Follow The Money.

CODE provides marginalized and vulnerable communities with resources to amplify their voices with independence and integrity while providing the communities with information that ushers social and economic progress. To enhance effective democratic governance and accountability, CODE creates platforms [mobile and web technologies] that close the feedback loop between citizens and the government. With global expertise and reach, we focus on community outreach, influencing policies, practices, and knowledge mobilization.

CODE’s commitment to participatory capacity & community building and monitoring and evaluation creates effective and sustainable programs even within the most challenging environments.
In October 2017, CODE commenced tracking government and international aid spending in Northern Nigeria, with particular focus on first-mile healthcare delivery and infrastructural provision for universal basic education. Our aim was to advance economic governance and promote transparency and accountability at State and Local levels in Nigeria. Our team empowered 84 communities in Yobe, Kano, Plateau, Borno, Kaduna and Adamawa states with information, data and knowledge to engage their elected government representatives on funds earmarked for capital projects in their communities. At the end of the project duration, we had tracked NGN 523,743,810 (USD 1,454,843.92) and impacted 1,276,780 people.

To ensure community ownership of the Follow The Money model, we organised community gatherings in Yobe, Adamawa, Borno, Plateau and Kano States, hosting community leaders, CBOs, religious leaders, SBMCs and PTA members, women leaders, youth leaders, other local groups, and local media organizations from an estimated 40 communities across the 5 states respectively. Over the course of the project cycle, we discovered a large vacuum in information sharing by the government, low compliance to the Freedom of Information Act, non-inclusion of community governance structures in project implementation, discrepancies across project sites and low citizens participation in governance processes.

We launched the Follow The Money Challenge to reward citizens for tracking projects in their communities, using the FTM tracking tool. Through the Follow the Money Campus Tour, over 3000 Young Nigerian Students across Nigerian Universities were empowered and sensitized on a youth-inclusive governance which sparked mass social action to demand for improved public service delivery from...
The solution for grassroots communities to achieve quality public service delivery is largely dependent on how accessible government information on development projects are. This lack of information has worsened underdevelopment and widened the rural-urban poverty gap. The feedback gap between communities and their governments on either side of the social contract allows corruption to fester over time, enabling leakages in capital expenditures through the diversion of public funds. CODE's Follow The Money reinforces the need to build trust and create effective and consistent interaction between the government and the people.

There are over 13 million out-of-school children across Nigeria; but many that are enrolled, are at the risk of learning in very unsuitable conditions. Although universal basic education should be free, access remains expensive for children who come from peasant backgrounds, as governments struggle to decide where their priorities lie between extravagance and investing in the future. The same goes for first-mile healthcare service delivery, which has the potential of eradicating neonatal, infant and maternal mortality rates in a country where the numbers are worse only in India.

To promote effective budgetary and service delivery in the implementation of critical infrastructures, Follow The Money secured an 18-month grant from OSIWA with the objective of strengthening citizen’s participation in social contracting in health and education infrastructures in northern Nigeria. The project was implemented in Kano, Borno, Yobe, Kaduna, Adamawa and Plateau States respectively.

This report seeks to highlight the outcomes of the monitoring activities, as well as other sustainable citizen engagement activities piloted during the project implementation. Monitoring and tracking activities carried out throughout the project cycle in the project states are highlighted in this report.
United Nations 2019 SDGs Mobilizer Award

Our home-grown initiative, Follow The Money, emerged winner of the 2019 United Nations Sustainable Development Goals Mobilizer Award!

The award recognised Follow The Money as a leading initiative with demonstrated successes in mobilizing citizens or volunteers to act for the realization of the SDGs 2030 agenda.

Follow The Money was nominated among the top 21 initiatives from 142 countries showcasing how innovation, creativity and commitment has led to impactful SDG Actions from over 2000 entries of amazing organizations & initiatives around the globe.

The award was received by CODE’s Chief Executive, Hamzat Lawal, at the SDGs Global Festival of Action in Bonn, Germany.

Council of Europe Democracy Innovation Award

The social accountability initiative was recognised as one of the leading ground-breaking initiatives in the world, that is promoting democratic principles, after its Communications Lead, Kevwe Oghide, made a presentation on how Follow The Money is working to rebuild trust in Nigerian institutions.

Follow The Money emerged winner from among 27 brilliant ideas across Europe and the World.

The Secretary-General of the Council of Europe, Marija Pejčinović Burić, said that Follow The Money has shown exemplary leadership in advancing democratic governance. She added that the internet, social media and artificial intelligence have all democratized access to information and given millions of people their voice. The challenge is to ensure that information contributes to democracy, which Follow The Money is doing.

The award was presented at the Council of Europe’s World Forum for Democracy 2019, and received by Kevwe Oghide, in Strasbourg, France.

In November 2019, Follow The Money again won the 2019 Council of Europe’s Democracy Innovation Award, competing against France and Poland.
Strengthening Citizen's Participation in Social Contracting
TRACKING PROJECTS IN KANO STATE

Nos of Project Tracked: 9
Population Reached: 489,915
Amount Tracked: NGN 145,000,000.00

Ongoing
Completed
Health
Education
No project

Dambatta
General Renovation of Gwanda Comprehensive Health Centre

Tofa
Construction of Primary Healthcare Center

Kumbotso
Construction Of Primary Health Care Centre

Garun Malam
Rehabilitation/Upgrade of Chiromawa Idi Primary School

Kabo
Construction of 20 Bedward

Sumaila
Completion of Islamiyya Classroom Block

Sumaila
Construction of 3 Blocks of Nomadic Primary School Block, Store

Gwale
Renovations of Classes, Water and Furniture

Gwale
Renovations of Classes, Water and Furniture

Project Impact Report  2017-2019
We tracked nine projects across eight LGAs of Kano State, reaching 489,915 people. Four projects were for the construction or rehabilitation of schools, while the other five were for the provision or upgrading of health infrastructure. The contracts awarded for all nine projects were at the local government level; and as at the time of writing this report, only two projects were completed - #RenovateGwanda and #RehabilitateKabo, both health projects.
In 2016, the Kaduna State Government launched the Health is Wealth campaign to boost the health sector and provide quality health care services to its citizenry. As such, the state government planned to modernize a total of 255 PHCs, one in each ward across the state, equipped with items such as ultrasound scans and other equipment that can enhance healthcare delivery.

In 2019, to measure the extent at which government reforms in the state have been translated into actual social change for all, Follow The Money activated the #EquipMadachi Campaign to monitor the construction of a PHC At Madachi worth NGN 14,051,336.25. Madachi is a community in Kauru LGA of Kaduna state.

Our courtesy visit to the Executive Chairman of Kauru LGA, Hon. Shuaibu Goma facilitated our tracking activity as the Chairman was open to collaboration and provided the bill of quantities for the project to ensure effective oversight over the project implementation. An evaluation visit to the facility revealed that the project was completed, although the fence was yet to be constructed and the facility was not in use due to lack of hospital equipment and furniture.
TRACKING PROJECTS IN BORNO STATE

Nos of Project Tracked:  2
Local Government Areas:
Population Reached: 60,000
Amount Tracked: NGN 20,000,000 est

- Biu
  - Construction and Furnishing Of 1 Block Of 3 Classroom

- Mairi Kuwait
  - Construction of 2 Blocks of (3) Classrooms

Legend:
- Ongoing
- No project
- Education
Assessing Accountability Structures In Borno State

In Borno State, we tracked two education projects, using #ErectMairiKuwait for the construction of two blocks of three classrooms each at Maimusuri Primary and Junior Secondary School in Mairi Kuwait as part of 2017 Jere Federal Constituency projects in Borno State; and #ContractZuthu for the construction and furnishing of one Block of three classrooms at Zuthu Primary School, Miringa, Biu LGA. The influx of IDPs from Bama and Gwoza LGAs, into Mairi Kuwait to swell its population to more than 10,000, meant that the existing public school in the village was overpopulated. Follow The Money monitored the project to completion although the use of substandard materials in the project construction was largely recorded.
TRACKING PROJECTS IN ADAMA WA STATE

Nos of Project Tracked:  2
Population Reached:  9,565
Amount Tracked:  NGN 20,000,000

Lainde Badirisa, Girei
Construction of School Project

Ganye
Construction of a Block of 3 Classrooms

Not Started
Completed
Education
No project

Project Impact Report  2017-2019
We tracked two State Universal Basic Education Board projects in Adamawa, using #EducateGirei for the construction of school projects in Lainde Badirisa, Girei LGA; and #EducateGangtiyaBumso for the construction of a block of three classrooms with furniture and instructional materials at GangtiyaBumso in Gamu LGA. Our investigations through the FOI letter to the implementing agency revealed that the project was yet to be funded. Further social media advocacy on the #EducateGirei campaign also drew the attention of the Member of the Federal House of Representatives for Laide-Badirisa who responded to the team via twitter. He tweeted from his official Twitter handle @AbdulraufModib1

#EducateGangtiyaBumso was for the tracking of the construction of a block of three classrooms with furniture and instructional materials at GangtiyaBumso in Gamu as one of its 2017 constituency projects worth NGN 20 million with Project Code: UBE82398964. Gangtiya Bumso is a rural community within Gamu in Ganye LGA with an estimated population size of 6,000. Through our advocacy, Honourable Abdulrazaq Sa’ad Namdas - a member, representing Gangtiyabumso Federal Constituency at the National Assembly, visited the construction site and provided more insights on the project with commitments to make available school furniture with his personal fund. At the time of writing this report, this project has been completed and currently in use.
TRACKING PROJECTS IN YOBE STATE

Nos of Project Tracked: 50
Population Reached: 508,000
Amount Tracked: NGN 235,125,557
In Yobe State, we tracked 50 projects which reached over 508,000 across the State; worth an estimated NGN 235,125,557 budgeted for health and education projects. Our tracking activities were focused on projects implemented by the Border Community Development Agencies, Yobe State Universal Basic Education Board and different Local Government Authorities. Before our intervention, none of the projects had commenced, but at the time of writing this report, 48 projects had been completed and 1 is currently ongoing.

One project of note, is #EducateJakusko where we tracked the construction of six blocks of classroom with a solar-powered borehole in Jakusko, Jakusko LGA, with funding support from the Border Community Development Agency. Jakusko has a population of about 17,000 and has a high number of school enrollees in Yobe State; however, this project was not completed at the time of writing this report, and the FTM team has been unable to get further information from BCDA, to track its implementation.

In Machina, we tracked the construction of a primary healthcare centre with a solar-powered borehole in Machina using #EquipMachina. Machina is the headquarters of Machina LGA, but the dilapidated PHC is the only health facility serving the estimated 15,000 people; who often require immediate referral to the Federal Medical Centre in Nguru for adequate healthcare.

#ConstructBursari and #EducateFune were launched to track two multi-site projects of twenty-nine and nineteen school projects across Fune and Bursari LGAs; and Yobe SUBEB were very cooperative, by sharing a summary of the bills of quantities for the forty-eight projects. The launch of our FTM Radio's live phone-in program on Sahel FM 89.50, Damaturu also provided a platform for citizen participation, information sharing and shared monitoring experience to ensure transparency and accountability.

Although project implementation in some sites was completed, some anomalies were recorded and in some cases contractors executed the projects with substandard materials. All these were reported to YOBE SUBEB, who acknowledged the intervention of FTM and this led to a policy review to allocate 2% of SUBEB/UBEB intervention to Monitoring, Evaluation and Supervision from 2019 intervention for effective service delivery. Also through our advocacy Yobe SUBEB directed all contractors to carry community stakeholders along in their implementation process.
TRACKING PROJECTS IN PLATEAU STATE

No of Projects Tracked- 19
Population Reached-187,300
Amount Tracked- NGN 103,618,253 est.

- 6 Completed Projects
- 7 unaccessible projects due to bad roads

- One ongoing Project

Not Started
Completed
Education
Ongoing
No project
In Plateau State, we tracked 19 projects, reaching 187,300 people and worth an estimated NGN 103,618,253 budgeted by the Plateau State Universal Basic Education Board and the different Local Government Authorities in the state. We also monitored #EducateDawaki for the rehabilitation and construction of classrooms in Dawaki, Kanke LGA. Although the project had been completed as at the time of writing this report, the construction materials were of poor quality, and some parts were already falling apart before others were completed or fitted. We ran #FurnishKurgwi to track the supply of furniture at GSS Kurgwi, Quan Pan LGA; #UpgradeKvom Mega to monitor and provide oversight over 15 school projects in Jos South estimated to cost NGN 64,618,253. As at the time of writing this report, there is no confirmation on the status of the projects, as the road networks to the various locations were inaccessible.
Increasing the Ownership of the

‘Follow The Money’ Model
The ‘Follow The Money’ Challenge was a contest to gauge citizens’ ability to independently hold governments accountable for accelerated public service delivery in their communities, without the support and guidance of CODE. This challenge was a test of the sustainability and replicability of the ‘Follow The Money’ model. The 2019 Challenge garnered 300 entries with a subsequent shortlist of 125 for the July - September duration of the Challenge. The top 3 of the 10 finalists emerged winners; receiving NGN 100,000 cash prize each, a medal of honour and an all-expense paid trip to the 2020 FTM Annual Convening.

MEET OUR CHAMPIONS

Muhammed Kime from Yobe state tracked the construction of a block of two classrooms, office and store in Brabra Primary School, Damaturu LGA worth 7,501,245,60 Naira. Funds allocated for this project would have been siphoned due to duplication of the project in the same school.

Ukeme Anwan from Akwa Ibom State tracked the construction of health posts in Edem Urua, Ibiono Ibom. The project has been completed and commissioned awaiting the provision of health facilities and drugs.

Kehinde Akinsola from Kwara State advocated for the renovation of Aliyahudeen Primary School, Ogidi, Ilorin West worth 10,000,000 Naira and raise the awareness of the community members to demand the project implementation.
Follow The Money Annual Convening converge all State Chapter Leads to rub minds on State achievements, progress made and key learnings. It was an opportunity to harvest outcomes, document milestones and set plans rolling for each project year. The Annual Convening gathers feedback, work processes, challenges, lessons learnt, knowledge sharing and peer review sessions.
We organized community champions' training in Yobe, Adamawa, Borno, Plateau and Kano States respectively; training 30 participants per state, drawn from youth leaders, community-based organisations, volunteers, local media organisations and SBMCs. The curriculum included budget tracking mechanisms, data mining and social accountability. The goal of the capacity strengthening activity was to increase local ownership of the 'Follow The Money' model, replicating the same in their communities eventually.
Collaborations with SUBEBs and SPHCDAs

Through mutual collaboration and needs assessments when working with MDAs proved difficult due to gaps in capacity; CODE intervened and held capacity strengthening training for more than two hundred public sector employees in Plateau, Yobe, Borno and Adamawa States, drawn from the SUBEBs and SPHCDAs. These training sessions provided basic and intermediate knowledge and understanding of the concepts of data process management, results-based monitoring and evaluation, social accountability and the 'Follow The Money' project monitoring model.
The Public and Private Development Centre held the 2019 FOI Ranking of MDAs in May, in partnership with Basic Rights Watch, Right To Know, BudgIT, Media Rights Agenda and CODE to launch the 2019 National Freedom of Information Compliance of over 200 federal parastatals. The indicators used for the report included proactive disclosure, level of disclosure, timeliness (responsiveness), FOI training, FOI Desk Officer and FOI Annual Report. This event provided public employees, the media and the general public with increased awareness on the usability of the FOI Act in requesting public information on project implementation and better quality service delivery.
The launch of Follow The Money Campus Tour at the University of Jos, Plateau State; Ahmadu Bello University Zaria, Kaduna State; and University of Bayero, Kano State represented CODE's strategy for expanding the FTM movement locally and internationally (having expanded to Kenya, Liberia, Cameroon and Malawi). At each event, school officials, lecturers, student union representatives, civil society groups, media outlets and students turned out to learn about social contracting and FTM. In total, 1,091 participants attended the three Campus Tours. This also led to an increase in student sign-ups on iFollowTheMoney, our virtual community for social contracting and ‘Follow The Money’.
Stimulating Rural Impact through FTM Community Gathering

In line with our social mobilization ambition alongside the quest to have citizens take ownership of the Follow The Money model which would address the sustainability concern of our processes, through the OSIWA support, we organized community gatherings across 5 northern states namely, Yobe, Adamawa, Borno, Plateau and Kano States. The community stakeholders were taking through our model with further capacity building sessions on budget tracking mechanisms and social accountability. The stakeholders included community leaders, Community Based Organizations, religious leaders, SBMC and Parents Teachers Association members, women leaders, youth leaders and groups, and local media organizations from an estimate of 40 communities in the highlighted states.
We launched FTM Toll-Free Line 0800000386 and weekly dispatch of bulk SMS to our members and those living in hard-to-reach communities to improve communication and feedback from communities and provide the necessary platform for citizens to keep engaging us on public service delivery and ultimately increase social accountability conversations on the FTM platform.

Our ifollowthemoney.org platform is the largest social accountability platform in Africa and a democratic imperative which serves as the voice of citizens. It has become essential in making service delivery equitable and sustainable. The platform curates the activities of our community champions, campaign reports and various opportunities with over 5327 people signed up, with a massive growth index from 1,143 in 2017 to 5,327 in 2019.

### Online Engagements

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2017 Media reach</th>
<th>2018 Media reach</th>
<th>2019 Media reach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Twitter</strong></td>
<td><strong>Twitter</strong></td>
<td><strong>Twitter</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2,914,003</td>
<td>4,600,023</td>
<td>6,614,021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impressions</td>
<td>Impressions</td>
<td>Impressions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2,567,835</td>
<td>376,846.</td>
<td>3,495,004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reach</td>
<td>Reach</td>
<td>Reach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Facebook</strong></td>
<td><strong>Facebook</strong></td>
<td><strong>Facebook</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2,567,835</td>
<td>3,495,004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reach</td>
<td>Reach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instagram</strong></td>
<td><strong>Instagram</strong></td>
<td><strong>Instagram</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1,212,232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registered</td>
<td>Registered</td>
<td>Registered</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impressions</td>
<td>Impressions</td>
<td>Impressions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reach</td>
<td>Reach</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Amplifying Campaigns

We also leveraged existing relationships with radio stations in Kano and recorded over 4,000,000 reaches and an average of 15 call-ins per episode.

Dala FM Kano

Follow The Money Radio activated on the following radio stations:

- Nigerian Info 95.10 FM Abuja
- Kanem FM Maiduguri
- Jay FM 101.9 Jos
- Sahel FM 89.5 Damaturu
- Dala FM Kano
Findings from the Field

Although some states have signed up to the open government partnership, there is still opaqueness by MDAs in publishing budgetary information on projects for public use. Community governance structures are not carried along during project nomination, contracting and implementation processes; thus, they are unable to independently monitor implementation and stimulate local ownership. There is no compliance to the FOI Act, and the absence of needs assessment and monitoring frameworks for project implementing agencies results in corruption and the delivery of substandard projects. In some states, there is a duplication of projects across locations, thereby resulting in the theft of public funds.

Challenges During Project Implementation

With a very low compliance culture to the FOI Act; the biggest challenge we encountered while implementing this project was the lack of access to project specifics. MDAs were generally unwilling to provide information on award sums, implementing agencies, contractor details and bills of quantities.

The insecurity experienced in the Northeast posed great impediment to our work. Tracking projects and providing real time reports require consistent visits to the community to gather updates and amplify the level of work done; but the threat of organized armed groups often limited our reach. Finally, insufficient funds limited the scope of our work. Sufficient funding was a bottleneck for us and as such, we were not able to reach out for an impact assessment of some of the projects.

Lessons Learnt

Everaging on local ownership of the process has been very instrumental in ensuring results. We often adjust our work processes to comply with prevailing local peculiarities and security challenges in host communities; and also tag our field teams with locals who assist us manage social group dynamics without interfering with local political and existing party dynamics. This is to avoid political infiltration, colouration or interpretation of our activities; and to manage the security and safety of our team during preliminary visits, community outreaches and town hall meetings.

Building collaboration with government institutions through courtesy visits, traditional and social media advocacy, capacity strengthening and training of government staff and SBMCs, ensured ease of engagement and data access in almost all the Project States.

Documenting findings and amplifying rural voices on diverse projects tracked through partnerships with radio stations across the States expanded our information-sharing platforms and public enlightenment. In states where we could not run paid follow the money radio programmes due to lack of financial resources, we were able to leverage on partnerships with radio and TV stations whose mission aligned with our core values in pushing out our contents and reaching a wider audience. In most cases, government agencies through our radio and TV programs responded to questions and issues concerning projects in diverse communities.

Our community mobilization strategy boosted institutional participation and engagements throughout the project. Ensuring community involvement throughout project implementation, motivated communities to take ownership of the process and utilize the information provided to hold their government to account. This was evident in all our meetings and during all our town hall meetings, as we recorded huge turnouts from traditional gatekeepers to young people, government representatives and security sector institutions.
SUBEB needs to develop a feedback loop that enables SBMCs to make important input in annual action plans to UBEC; including their active participation in needs assessment across communities to feed the UBE annual action plan.

SUBEB must create an information management system for SBMCs to access the list of school projects currently being implemented as well as project implementation data. This is to ensure that SBMCs are effective in project monitoring across schools with the necessary project and financial data. The existence of SBMCs will be futile if the committees are unable to effectively influence project planning and implementation.

SUBEB should mandate project contractors to always pay courtesy calls on community leaders at the commencement of projects or have communities in participation when the handing over of project sites to contractors is being carried out. This would ensure that communities are introduced to contractors formally for effective engagement between both parties and smooth monitoring by SBMCs. Feedback from the SBMCs and community leaders suggest that project contractors do not cooperate with the committee because SUBEB did not create formal linkages. Government’s Ministries, Departments and Agencies should complement SUBEB’s monitoring strategy and build-in health and WaSH monitoring teams across each community; and strengthen their capacities to conduct need assessments, participate in project nomination, and monitor implementation process.
The Open Society Initiative for West Africa (OSIWA) funds Follow The Money Project in Northern Nigeria, which involves advancing economic governance and promoting transparency and accountability at the sub-national levels of government in Nigeria.
Appendix

Campaigns detailed documentations, as well as pictures
OUR COMMITMENT TO GRASSROOTS

OUR VISION
We envision a world where all people – even in the most remote areas of the globe – can hold their government accountable.

OUR MISSION
To empower marginalized communities.

OUR OBJECTIVES
Increase people’s access to information through whatever technological means they choose.

Increase and share innovative approaches to information exchange through experimentation, research, and technology.

Develop innovative platforms for coverage of social, environmental and governance issues.

Increase the adoption and implementation of international development laws and policies.

From activist to trainers, trainers to mobilizers, mobilizers to community builders. We see the need to make governments accountable, and we do it by engaging them with verifiable facts.

HQ Office: 3rd floor, D-Wing, 10th Street, Bassan Plaza, Central Area, Abuja Nigeria.

connected_dev | 4lowment | www.connecteddevelopment.org
Sign Up: www.ifollowthemoney.org